# Self-reported cardiovascular disease risk factor screening among people living with HIV vs. members of the general population in Botswana: a community-based study 

Onkabetse Julia Molefe-Baikai ${ }^{1 *}$, Kago Kebotsamang ${ }^{2}$, Pinkie Modisawakgomo ${ }^{3}$, John Thato Thakanelo ${ }^{4}$, Keneilwe MotlhatIhedi ${ }^{4}$, Thato Moshomo ${ }^{1}$, Nabila Farah Youssouf ${ }^{3,5}$, Tiny Masupe ${ }^{4}$, Tendani Gaolathe ${ }^{1,3}$, Neo Tapela ${ }^{3,7,8}$, Shahin Lockman ${ }^{3,6,9}$ and Mosepele Mosepele ${ }^{1,3,6}$


#### Abstract

Background Morbidity and mortality due to cardiovascular diseases (CVDs) are high and increasing in low- and middle-income countries. People living with HIV (PLWH) are more likely to experience CVD than members of the general population. Therefore, we aimed to assess whether PLWH were more likely to have previously been screened for cardiovascular disease risk factors (CVDRFs) than people without HIV. Methods A population-based, cross-sectional study was conducted among individuals aged 16 to 68 years across 22 communities in Botswana from February to August 2017 as part of a larger community-based cluster randomized HIV treatment-as-prevention trial. Participants were asked if they had been screened for and counselled on cardiovascular disease risk factors (history of hypertension or blood pressure check, blood glucose and cholesterol measurements, weight check and weight control, tobacco smoking and cessation, alcohol use and physical activity) in the preceding 3 years. HIV testing was offered to those with an unknown HIV status. Multiple logistic regression analysis controlling for age and sex was used to assess the relationship between CVDRF screening and HIV status. Results Of the 3981 participants enrolled, 2547 (64\%) were female, and 1196 (30\%) were PLWH (93\% already on antiretroviral therapy [ART]. . PLWH were more likely to report previous screening for diabetes ( $25 \% \mathrm{vs}$. . $19 \%, p<0.001$ ), elevated cholesterol ( $17 \%$ vs. $12 \%, p<0.001$ ) and to have had their weight checked ( $76 \%$ vs. $55 \%, p<0.001$ ) than HIV-uninfected participants. PLWH were also more likely to have received counselling on salt intake ( $42 \%$ vs. $33 \%, p$ $<0.001$ ), smoking cessation ( $66 \%$ vs. $46 \%, p<0.001$ ), weight control ( $38 \%$ vs. $29 \%, p<0.001$ ), physical activity ( $46 \%$ vs. $34 \%, p<0.001$ ) and alcohol consumption ( $35 \%$ vs. $23 \%, p<0.001$ ) than their HIV-uninfected counterparts. Overall, PLWH were more likely to have received screening for and/or counselling on CVDRFs (adjusted odds ratio 1.84, 95\% Cl: 1.46-2.32, $p<0.001$ ).


[^0]Conclusion PLWH were almost two times more likely to have been previously screened for CVDRFs than those without HIV, indicating a need for universal scale-up of integrated management and prevention of CVDs in the HIVuninfected population.
Keywords Cardiovascular disease risk factors, HIV, Screening, PLWH, Botswana

## Background

Cardiovascular diseases (CVDs) are a worldwide epidemic with a rapid increase in middle- and low-income countries [1, 2]. CVD accounted for one-third of all global deaths in 2015, and there were an estimated 422 million prevalent CVD cases in the same year [3]. In 2012, CVD was the leading cause of noncommunicable disease (NCD) deaths among people under the age of 70 years globally ( $37 \%$ of NCD deaths) [4]. According to the world health organization (WHO) CVD account for 17.9 million deaths annually and remains the leading cause of NCD deaths in 2023 [5].

The global burden of cardiovascular disease attributable to HIV infection has also increased. Several studies have demonstrated an excess risk of cardiovascular diseases, including myocardial infarction, ischaemic stroke, pulmonary hypertension, and heart failure, among people living with HIV (PLWH) [6-12]. A recent meta-analysis of the burden of HIV-associated CVD demonstrated a twofold higher likelihood of developing CVD among PLWH than among HIV-uninfected individuals [13]. Since 1990, the rate and risk of cardiovascular disease among PLWH as well as the disability-adjusted life-years (DALYs) from HIV-associated CVD have been steadily rising, with the global population incidence rising threefold from $0.36 \%$ in 1990 to $0.92 \%$ in 2015 [13].
The highest HIV-attributable CVD burden has been reported in the sub-Saharan countries of Swaziland, Lesotho, Botswana and South Africa, where HIV accounts for more than $15 \%$ of the CVD burden [13]. Sub-Saharan Africa is experiencing a rise in CVD burden attributable to the increasing prevalence of traditional CVD risk factors (CVDRFs), the persistence of infectious causes of heart disease and the ageing HIV population with accompanying chronic comorbidities such as CVD [14-20].
CVDRFs tend to increase with age and often occur in clusters [21-26]. The Botswana STEPS survey on the key risk factors for NCD found that most adults have at least one of the five major risk factors for CVD, namely, current daily smoking, eating fewer than five servings of fruits and vegetables per day, a low level of physical activity, being overweight, and having elevated blood pressure [26].
Considering the potential clustering of CVDRFs, it is imperative that screening for CVDRFs be performed during routine adult care. Guidelines on the primary prevention of cardiovascular diseases recommend routine
screening, counselling and management of cardiovascular risk factors [27-29]. The Botswana multisectoral strategy for the prevention of NCDs includes the integration of NCD interventions and early screening for CVD at the primary health care level, with an aim of as much as $80 \%$ of type 2 diabetes being treated at the primary health care level [30-32].

Despite the guideline recommendation of CVD integration in primary care and HIV care settings [31, 32], there are limited data in Botswana regarding the extent of screening for CVDRFs among both PLWH and HIVuninfected individuals. The current study therefore aimed to assess the proportion of the population who had been screened for and counselled on CVDRFs by health care workers and to assess whether there was a difference in screening coverage based on HIV status. In this way, this study sought to advance knowledge on the practices of health care personnel regarding CVDRF screening as well as health counselling in a population with a high HIV prevalence. This study will further help to inform quality improvement strategies for early identification and better management of and subsequent reduction in CVD risk factors.

## Methods

## Study setting, study design and participants

This study on CVDRFs was nested in a large ongoing community-based cluster randomized trial that took place in 30 rural and peri-urban communities in Botswana (the Botswana Combination Prevention Project or BCPP). The BCPP was aimed at assessing the effect of a combination prevention package (including HIV treatment-as-prevention) on HIV incidence [33]. Consenting individuals aged 16-68 years in a simple random sample of approximately $20 \%$ of all households in the participating communities took part in the BCPP survey cohort and were followed up from 2013 to 2018.

During the final BCPP " $20 \%$ household" survey cohort visit (from February 2017 to August 2017), we enrolled individuals in 22 of the 30 communities in a nested substudy of CVDRFs and hypertension by convenience sampling. Screening for and counselling on CVDRFs was assessed at the final visit of the parent trial. Only citizens of Botswana were eligible to participate in this study.

## Data collection and materials

A trained study interviewer administered a CVDRF assessment and counselling survey questionnaire
developed for this study. The questionnaire consisted of closed-ended questions and was supplemented with a review of participants' medical documents where available and measurement of blood pressure (twice, at least 5 min apart) [34] and waist/hip circumference as per the World Health Organization guidelines [35]. The questionnaire was translated to Setswana (Setswana and English being the two national languages in the country) and back translated to English to ensure consistency in meaning. Participants were asked if a health care worker had asked about or performed any of the following in

Table 1 Demographic and clinical characteristics of the participants

| Characteristics | All $N=3981$ | HIV <br> infected $N=1196^{*}$ | HIV uninfected $N=2764$ | $\mathbf{P}$ <br> value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age, median (IQR) | $35(26,48)$ | $42(35,50)$ | $32(24,46)$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline< \\ & 0.001 \end{aligned}$ |
| 16-24, N (\%) | 647 (16) | 42 (4) | 599 (22) |  |
| 25-34, N (\%) | 1131 (28) | 202(17) | 921 (33) |  |
| 35-44, N (\%) | 905 (23) | 416 (35) | 485 (18) |  |
| 45-54, N (\%) | 620 (16) | 316 (26) | 303 (11) |  |
| 55-68, N (\%) | 678 (17) | 320 (18) | 456 (16) |  |
| Sex |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & < \\ & 0.001 \end{aligned}$ |
| Female, N (\%) | 2547 (64) | 879 (73) | 1657 (60) |  |
| Education level ${ }^{\text {\# }}$ |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & < \\ & 0.001 \end{aligned}$ |
| Non-formal, N (\%) | 467 (12) | 181 (15) | 286 (10) |  |
| Primary, N (\%) | 836 (21) | 373 (31) | 461 (17) |  |
| Secondary, N (\%) | 2075 (52) | 568 (48) | 1497 (54) |  |
| Higher than secondary N (\%) | 585(15) | 67(6) | 509(19) |  |
| Cigarette smoking |  |  |  |  |
| Yes, N (\%) | 534 (13) | 163 (14) | 368 (13) | 0.800 |
| Blood Pressure, mmHg |  |  |  |  |
| Systolic, median (IQR) | $\begin{aligned} & 119(109, \\ & 130) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 117(108, \\ & 128) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 119 \\ & (109,130) \end{aligned}$ | 0.011 |
| Diastolic, median (IQR) | $80(72,88)$ | $\begin{aligned} & 79.5 \text { (72, } \\ & 88) \end{aligned}$ | $80(72,88)$ | 0.659 |
| Waist-to-Hip Ratio |  |  |  |  |
| Female, Median (IQR) | $\begin{aligned} & 0.84 \text { ( } 0.79 \text {, } \\ & 0.91) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.85 \\ & (0.80,0.92) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.84 \text { ( } 0.78 \text {, } \\ & 0.91) \end{aligned}$ | 0.006 |
| Male, Median (IQR) | $\begin{aligned} & 0.86 \text { ( } 0.81, \\ & 0.93 \text { ) } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.88 \\ & (0.83,0.95) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.85(0.81, \\ & 0.93) \end{aligned}$ | 0.009 |
| Currently prescribed antihypertensive medication |  |  |  |  |
| Yes, N (\%) | 350 (9) | 112 (9) | 237 (9) | 0.428 |
| No, N (\%) | 3631 (91) | 1084 (91) | 2527 (91) |  |
| Median CD4 count, cells/ul, (IQR) | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & 542.5 \\ & (402,730) \end{aligned}$ | N/A | N/A |
| ART status |  |  |  |  |
| On ART, N (\%) | N/A | 1110 (93) | N/A | N/A |
| ART-naïve, N (\%) | N/A | 70 (6) | N/A | N/A |
| ART defaulter, N (\%) | N/A | 16 (1) | N/A | N/A |

the preceding 3 years: history of hypertension or blood pressure check, blood glucose measurement, blood cholesterol measurement, weight check and weight control, tobacco smoking and smoking cessation, alcohol use and moderate physical activity. Information on the participant's HIV status was obtained by word of mouth and confirmed from medical records. HIV testing was offered to those with an unknown HIV status, and those found to be HIV-infected were referred to a local health facility for further management. The diagnosis of hypertension was based either on the presence of treated hypertension (current receipt of any antihypertensive) regardless of the current blood pressure (BP) or systolic BP $\geq 140$ and/or diastolic blood pressure $\geq 90 \mathrm{mmHg}$ (as measured during the study visit).

## Statistical analysis

Statistical analyses were conducted using R statistical software (version 4.2.2, R Core Team 2022). Demographic and clinical characteristics were summarized by performing a standard descriptive analysis [percentages, medians and interquartile range (IQR)]. The chi-square test for independence was used to assess the association between categorical variables, whereas the Wilcoxon rank sum test was used to compare the medians of the continuous variables by HIV status. Logistic regression was performed to assess the relationship between HIV status and screening for/counselling on CVDRFs. Multiple logistic regression was then performed to adjust for age and sex. A p value less than 0.05 was considered statistically significant.

## Results

We included 3981 participants in this study, of whom 2547 (64\%) were female. The median age (IQR) of PLWH [42(35-50)] was significantly higher than that of HIVuninfected people [32(24-46)]. 30\% (1196 out of 3981) of the participants were PLWH, the vast majority (93\%) of whom were on antiretroviral therapy. HIV-uninfected participants were more likely to have a secondary level education or higher ( $73 \%$ vs. $54 \%, p<0.001$ ) than PLWH.

Cigarette smoking was generally low among the participants, with only 534 (13\%) actively smoking cigarettes. PLWH had a higher waist-to-hip ratio than HIV-uninfected participants, with a median (IQR) waist-to-hip ratio of $0.85(0.80-0.92)$ vs. $0.84(0.78-0.91, p=0.006)$ for females and $0.88(0.83-0.95)$ vs. $0.85(0.81-0.93, p=$ 0.009 ) for males, respectively.

The participants' characteristics stratified by HIV status are summarized in Table 1.

## Screening and counselling for cardiovascular disease risk factors

Despite $71 \%$ of all participants having been screened for or counselled on at least one CVDRF, screening for or counselling on individual CVDRFs was generally low. PLWH were more likely than HIV-uninfected participants to be screened for and counselled on each CVDRF that we inquired about (Table 2). The total number of CVDRFs screened for per respondent was also compared between PLWH and HIV-uninfected individuals. PLWH were again more likely to be screened for or counselled on more CVDRFs with a median (IQR) of 3 $(1-5)$ screened factors compared to a median of $1(0-4)$ screened factor for their HIV-uninfected counterparts.

We evaluated several demographic and clinical characteristics as individual (univariate) predictors of screening for/counselling on at least one CVDRF (Table 3). We found that having HIV and hypertension and older age were all associated with being screened for/counselled on at least one CVDRF.
Factors that were associated with being screened for/ counselled on CVDRFs in the univariate model ( $p<0.05$ ) were then included in a multivariable model adjusting for age, sex and hypertension status. HIV-positive status remained significantly associated with being screened or counselled for CVDRFs in the final multivariable model (AOR 1.84, 95\% CI: 1.46-2.32, $p<0.001$ ) (Table 4).

## Subgroup analysis of study population aged 35 years and above

To assess if age is the main factor driving the discrepancies in screening rates for CVDRFs by HIV status, the screening/counselling rates was assessed for participants aged 35 years or older stratified by HIV status (Tables 5, 6 and 7). When excluding persons less than 35 years of age, screening for some of the CVDRFs was not significantly different by HIV status. In particular, diabetes screening, cholesterol screening, salt intake and weight control counsel were not significantly different between PLWH and people without HIV for this sub-population. However, PLWH aged 35 years and above were more likely to have been screened for at least one CVDRF and had significantly higher number of CVDRF screened for and counselled on (Table 5). The adjusted odds ratio (OR) for HIV status were reduced slightly from 1.84 to 1.75 .

## Discussion

In this population-based study conducted in a country with a well-established HIV care programme, we demonstrated that while screening and counselling were generally low for each CVDRF, PLWH were overall, more likely to be screened for CVDRFs, including diabetes and hypercholesterolaemia, and more likely to have had their weight checked in the preceding 3 years than those who

Table 2 Screening and counselling coverage for CVD risk factors by HIV status

| Counselling/Screening | ALL <br> $\mathbf{n ( \% )}$ | HIV <br> Infected <br> $\mathbf{n ( \% )}$ | HIV <br> Uninfected <br> $\mathbf{n}(\%)$ | p <br> value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Diabetes screening | 838 | $299(25.0)$ | $536(19.4)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(21.0)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Cholesterol screening | 536 | $201(16.8)$ | $332(12.0)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(13.5)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Weight checked in preced- | 2426 | $904(75.6)$ | $1510(54.6)$ | $<$ |
| ing 3 years | $(60.9)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Salt intake counselling | 1426 | $505(42.2)$ | $916(33.1)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(35.8)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Smoking cessation | 275 | $107(65.6)$ | $168(45.7)$ | $<$ |
| counselling | $(51.5)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Weight control counselling | 1260 | $453(37.9)$ | $802(29.0)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(31.7)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Physical activity counselling | 1486 | $555(46.4)$ | $926(33.5)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(37.3)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Alcohol counselling | 1050 | $420(35.1)$ | $627(22.7)$ | $<$ |
|  | $(26.4)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| One or more CVDRFs | 2841 | $975(81.5)$ | $1851(67.0)$ | $<$ |
| Screened for | $(71.4 \%)$ |  |  | 0.001 |
| Total CVDRFs screened for* | $2(0-4)$ | $3(1-5)$ | $1(0-4)$ | $<$ |
|  |  |  |  | 0.001 |

* The Wilcoxon rank sum test was used to compare the medians

Table 3 Univariate analysis of factors associated with screening and counselling for at least one CVDRF

|  | Screened/Counselled for 1 or more risk factors |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | n (\%) | Unadjusted odds ratio (95\% CI) | $P$ <br> value |
| HIV Status* |  |  |  |
| Negative (ref) | 1851 (67) | reference |  |
| Positive | 975 (82) | 2.17 (1.84-2.57) | < 0.001 |
| Hypertension |  |  |  |
| None (ref) | 1449 (72) | reference |  |
| Hypertensive | 605 (79) | 1.47 (1.21-1.80) | < 0.001 |
| Sex* |  |  |  |
| Female (ref) | 1932 (76) | reference |  |
| Male | 909 (63) | 0.55 (0.48-0.63) | < 0.001 |
| Age* |  |  |  |
| 16-24* (ref) | 370 (13) | reference |  |
| 25-34 | 782 (28) | 1.67 (1.37-2.05) | < 0.001 |
| 35-44 | 678 (24) | 2.23 (1.80-2.78) | < 0.001 |
| 45-54 | 484 (17) | 2.66 (2.08-3.41) | < 0.001 |
| 55-68 | 527 (18) | 2.61 (2.06-3.32) | < 0.001 |
| Level of Education |  |  |  |
| Non-formal (ref) | 350 (74.9) | reference |  |
| Primary | 636 (76.1) | 1.06 (0.82-1.38) | 0.648 |
| Junior | 947 (66.8) | 0.67 (0.53-0.85) | 0.001 |
| Senior | 465 (70.7) | 0.81 (0.61-1.05) | 0.114 |
| Tertiary | 429 (73.3) | 0.92 (0.70-1.21) | 0.553 |

Table 4 Factors associated with screening and counselling for at least one CVDRF

|  | Adjusted <br> odds ratio | $\mathbf{9 5 \% ~ C I}$ | p <br> value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| HIV Status* <br> Negative | reference |  |  |
| Positive <br> Hypertension status <br> None | 1.84 | $(1.46,2.32)$ | $<0.001$ |
| $\quad$ Hypertensive | reference |  |  |
| Sex* | 1.21 | $(1.15-1.27)$ | $<0.001$ |
| Female | reference |  |  |
| Male | 0.92 | $(0.89,0.94)$ | $<0.001$ |
| Age* | reference |  |  |
| 16-24 | 1.1 | $(1.05,1.14)$ | $<0.001$ |
| 25-34 | 1.14 | $(1.09,1.19)$ | $<0.001$ |
| 35-44 | 1.15 | $(1.09,1.22)$ | $<0.001$ |
| 45-54 | 1.17 | $(1.10,1.25)$ | $<0.001$ |
| 55-68 |  |  |  |
| Level of Education | reference | $(0.95,1.06)$ | 0.746 |
| Non-formal | 1.01 | $(0.96,1.08)$ | 0.5996 |
| Primary | 1.02 | $(1.03,1.17)$ | 0.005 |
| Junior | 1.1 | $(1.05,1.19)$ | 0.009 |
| Senior | 1.12 |  |  |
| Tertiary |  |  |  |

Table 5 Screening and counselling coverage for CVD risk factors by HIV status for participants who are 35 years or older

| Counselling/ Screening | ALL n (\%) | HIV <br> Infected <br> n (\%) | HIV-Unin- <br> fected <br> n (\%) | $p$-value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Diabetes screening | $\begin{aligned} & 596 \\ & (28.3) \end{aligned}$ | 243 (26.4) | 350 (29.6) | 0.114 |
| Cholesterol screening | $\begin{aligned} & 362 \\ & (17.2) \end{aligned}$ | 161 (17.5\%) | 191 (16.9\%) | 0.739 |
| Weight Checked in 3 years | $\begin{aligned} & 1,402 \\ & (66.5) \end{aligned}$ | 698 (75.9) | 699 (59.2) | $<0.001$ |
| Salt intake Counsel | 937 <br> (44.4) | 405 (44.0) | 528 (44.7) | 0.787 |
| Smoke Cessation Counsel | $\begin{aligned} & 173 \\ & (59.2) \end{aligned}$ | 93 (69.9\%) | 80 (50.3\%) | 0.001 |
| Weight control Counsel | $\begin{aligned} & 781 \\ & (37.0) \end{aligned}$ | 354 (38.5) | 424 (35.9) | 0.243 |
| Physical Activity Counsel | $\begin{aligned} & 904 \\ & (43.0) \end{aligned}$ | 431 (46.8) | 473 (40.1) | 0.002 |
| Alcohol Counsel | $\begin{aligned} & 603 \\ & (28.7) \end{aligned}$ | 327 (35.5) | 276 (23.4\%) | $<0.001$ |
| One or more CVDRF screened | $\begin{aligned} & 1,621 \\ & (77.2) \end{aligned}$ | 748 (81.3) | 873 (73.9) | $<0.001$ |
| Total of CVDRF screened* | $2(1-5)$ | 3 (1-5) | 2 (0-4) | $<0.001$ |

did not have HIV. Moreover, PLWH were more likely to receive counselling on salt intake, smoking cessation, weight control, physical activity and alcohol consumption than HIV-uninfected participants. This difference

Table 6 Univariate sub-analysis of factors associated with screening and counselling for at least one CVDRF for participants aged 35 or above

|  | Screened/ <br> Counselled for <br> or more risk <br> factors |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | n (\%) | Unadjusted <br> Odds ratio (95\% | P |
|  |  | value |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  | - |  |
| CI) |  |  |  |

Table 7 Factors associated with screening and counselling for at least one CVDRF for participants aged 35 or over

|  | Adjusted <br> Odds ratio | $\mathbf{9 5 \% ~ C I}$ | p- <br> value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| HIV Status*    <br> Negative -   <br> Positive <br> Hypertension status 1.75 $(1.40,2.19)$ $<0.001$ <br> None -   <br> Hypertensive <br> Sex 5.23 $(3.44,8.30)$ $<0.001$ <br> Female -   <br> Male 0.75 $(0.60-0.94)$ 0.010 <br> Age reference   <br> 35-44 1.15 $(0.86,1.53)$ 0.355 <br> 45-54 1.27 $(0.91,1.76)$ 0.157 <br> 55-68    <br> Level of Education - - 0.458 <br> Non-formal 1.12 $(0.83,1.50)$ 0.142 <br> Primary 1.31 $(0.91,1.76)$ 0.004 <br> Junior 2.27 $(1.33,4.01)$ 0.003 <br> Senior 2.03 $(1.27,3.28)$ 0.003 <br> Tertiary    |  |  |  |

persisted among the population aged 35 years and above except for diabetes and hypercholesterolemia screening.

Nearly two-thirds (64\%) of the study population was female, which is consistent with data obtained from the national health survey in which $67 \%$ of the population was female [26]. The 30\% prevalence of HIV in the study population and the high (93\%) ART use in this sub-study is consistent with findings of the main BCPP trial [33, 36] but is higher than the national adult HIV prevalence of $18 \%$ [37]. The median age of 35 years in the current study could explain the high HIV prevalence, as the national estimate of HIV prevalence among people 35-39 years of age is $42 \%$ [37].

Our findings suggest that PLWH were more likely to have received screening for and counselling on CVDRFs than HIV-uninfected participants. This difference persisted after the multivariate analysis that adjusted for age, sex and hypertension status. There are several plausible explanations for this. First, PLWH receive longitudinal outpatient primary care, while most young people without HIV do not receive this care (and rather interact with the health system in cases of illness or pregnancy). Almost all the participants living with HIV were on ART. In the national HIV care program, this results in a minimum of 2 primary care consultations a year with monthly prescription refills, thus increasing the chances of screening and counselling. In contrast, there is no wellestablished routine primary preventive care program, including on CVDRFs, for those who do not have HIV in Botswana. Second, the knowledge that CVD events occur at higher rates in PLWH than in the general population [38] and a strong association between ART use and CVD mortality risk [39] might have led to more vigilant and systematic screening for CVDRFs in PLWH. Third, some integration of CVDRF screening and counselling into HIV care programmes may explain the difference in the screening and counselling proportions seen between PLWH and the general population [32, 40]. Though the Botswana multisectoral strategy for prevention of NCDs was later adopted in 2018 [30], at the time of the current study, integrated HIV clinical care was already in operation, having been adopted in 2016 [32].

Data on screening and counselling for CVDRFs are generally scant. A study of 175 South African PLWH on antiretroviral therapy demonstrated low screening for and management of CVDRFs, with tobacco smoking included on the list of risk factors screened for [41]. The same study reported that $99.4 \%$ of participants had at least one weight measurement in their medical records, with $21.1 \%$ and $28.6 \%$ of participants being overweight and obese, respectively. However, only 10.9\% of the participants reported having been informed of being overweight or obese by their health care provider [41]. The same gap between weight measurement and
self-reported behavioural counselling on weight reduction was demonstrated in our current study. The South African study did not compare self-reported screening/ counselling by HIV status, and it was conducted among urban PLWH whereas the current study was rural and peri-urban-based.
It is, however, worth noting that the guidelines on the integration of CVD care are not limited to HIV care programmes. Treatment guidelines have recently recommended the integration of CVD screening, management and counselling in primary health care settings [27, 29, 31]. Despite these recommendations, our study showed lower CVDRF screening in the non-HIV population, demonstrating an implementation gap in the management of cardiovascular diseases in Botswana. This is despite the fact that according to the STEPS survey, most adults in Botswana have at least one of the five major risk factors for CVD [26]. Similar findings have been demonstrated in other sub-Saharan countries in which primary health care facilities were not providing services for common noncommunicable diseases such as hypertension, obesity and diabetes despite policies guiding them to do so [42, 43].

Our study current study was conducted prior to the implementation of dolutegravir-containing regimen like tenofovir, lamivudine and dolutegravir (TLD) as firstline for the treatment of HIV. The Botswana integrated HIV clinical care guidelines of 2016 had just come into effect and the wide use of TLD had not taken effect. Since 2016, there has been an uptake and wide use of TLD in the country and with the metabolic concerns associated with its use [44, 45], screening and counselling on CVD risk factors has become even more significant.

## Study limitations

This study has some limitations. First, although this study included a representative random sample of households across Botswana (a strength of this study), most were either rural or peri-urban. Urban areas and remote settlements were not represented, and hence, the sample might not be representative of the entire country. Second, self-reported instead of verifiable documented screening/counselling could have contributed to recall and desirability bias and error. Third, we could not adjust for certain unmeasured potential confounders, including the type of health facility available to the population and the knowledge and experience of health care providers regarding CVDRFs. However, our study did adjust for major confounders (age and sex). Fourth, we did not assess the impact of CVDRF screening and/or counselling on health outcomes.
Despite these limitations, this large, population-based study is one of the first to demonstrate CVDRF screening
habits and counselling on these CVDRFs by health care workers in day-to-day health care delivery by HIV status.

## Conclusions

Although Botswana is on track towards achieving the UNAIDS 95-95-95 targets [36] and with it, the integration of screening and counselling for CVDRFs, and having generally adopted CVD management integration strategies in primary health care, this study identified a gap in the screening of the general population for CVDRFs. This discrepancy calls for the strengthening of primary health care systems to provide regular screening, management and counselling on CVDRFs in the general population. The successful HIV care program could serve as a model for integration.

| Abbreviations |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| CVD | Cardiovascular disease |
| PLWH | People living with HIV |
| CVDRFs | Cardiovascular disease risk factors |
| HIV | Human immunodeficiency virus |
| NCD | Noncommunicable disease |
| WHO | World Health Organization |
| WHO PEN | WHO package of essential noncommunicable disease |
|  | interventions |
| BP | Blood pressure |
| IQR | Interquartile range |
| DALYS | Disability-adjusted life-years |

## Acknowledgements

The authors are very grateful to the participants, the community leaders, the staff in the health care facilities of the various communities, the Centers for Disease Control (CDC), USA, the Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, PEPFAR, and the NIH RCRE (P20CA210283) for their support in conducting this study.

## Author contributions

MM and OJM-B were involved in the conception of the study, data analysis, and drafting and revising of the manuscript. SL and TG were involved in the design of the study and critical revision of the manuscript. PM and KK were involved in data entry, analysis and manuscript review. JTT and KM, TM, NFY, NT and TM contributed to interpretation of the data and manuscript revision. All authors reviewed and approved the final manuscript and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

## Funding

The parent study was supported by the President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) through the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) (cooperative agreements U01 GH000447 and U2G GH001911). The funding agencies had no role in the design, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript. The contents of this article are solely the responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official views of the funder.

## Data availability

The data and transcripts used during the study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request. The deidentified survey data are available from the Botswana Combination Prevention Project Executive Committee for researchers who meet the criteria for access to confidential data.

## Declarations

## Ethics approval and consent to participate

All methods were carried out in accordance with relevant guidelines and regulations in the Declaration of Helsinki. This study obtained ethical approval from the Botswana Health Research Development Committee (Institutional

Review Board of the Botswana Ministry of Health and Wellness) and the United States CDC Institutional Review Board. The district authorities provided permission for this study. Written informed consent was obtained from all study participants. Informed consent to participate was obtained from parents/legal guardians of minor participants. Participants aged 16-18 years provided informed written assent. All transcripts and study materials were confidentially treated to protect the privacy and confidentiality of study participants and were only accessible to the study investigators.

## Consent for publication

Not applicable.

## Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

## Author details

${ }^{1}$ Faculty of Medicine, Department of Internal Medicine, University of Botswana, Princess Marina Hospital, Gaborone, Botswana
${ }^{2}$ Faculty of Social Sciences, Department of Statistics, University of
Botswana, Gaborone, Botswana
${ }^{3}$ Botswana Harvard AIDS Institute Partnership, Gaborone, Botswana
${ }^{4}$ Faculty of Medicine, Department of Family Medicine and Public Health, University of Botswana, Gaborone, Botswana
${ }^{5}$ London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, UK
${ }^{6}$ Department of Immunology and Infectious Diseases, Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, USA
${ }^{7}$ International Consortium for Health Outcomes Measurement, Boston, USA
${ }^{8}$ Division of Global Health Equity, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, USA
${ }^{9}$ Division of Infectious Diseases, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, USA

Received: 28 June 2023 / Accepted: 3 January 2024
Published online: 16 January 2024

## References

1. Celermajer DS, Chow CK, Marijon E, Anstey NM, Woo KS. Cardiovascular disease in the developing world: prevalences, patterns, and the potential of early disease detection. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2012;60(14):1207-16.
2. Keates AK, Mocumbi AO, Ntsekhe M, Sliwa K, Stewart S. Cardiovascular disease in Africa: epidemiological profile and challenges. Nat Reviews Cardiol. 2017;14(5):273-93.
3. Roth GA, Johnson C, Abajobir A, Abd-Allah F, Abera SF, Abyu G, Ahmed M, Aksut B, Alam T, Alam K. Global, regional, and national burden of cardiovascular diseases for 10 causes, 1990 to 2015. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2017;70(1):1-25.
4. Organization WH. Global status report on noncommunicable diseases 2014. World Health Organization; 2014.
5. Noncommunicable Diseases Fact Sheets. [https://www.who.int/news-room/ fact-sheets/detail/noncommunicable-diseases].
6. Freiberg MS, Chang C-CH, Kuller LH, Skanderson M, Lowy E, Kraemer KL, Butt AA, Goetz MB, Leaf D, Oursler KA. HIV infection and the risk of acute myocardial infarction. JAMA Intern Med. 2013;173(8):614-22.
7. Drozd DR, Kitahata MM, Althoff KN, Zhang J, Gange SJ, Napravnik S, Burkholder GA, Mathews WC, Silverberg MJ, Sterling TR. Increased risk of myocardial infarction in HIV-infected individuals in North America compared to the general population. Journal of acquired immune deficiency syndromes (1999) 2017, 75(5):568.
8. Anne-Lise P, Chang C-CH, So-Armah KA, Butt AA, Leaf DA, Budoff M, Rimland D, Bedimo R, Goetz MB, Rodriguez-Barradas MC. Human immunodeficiency virus infection, cardiovascular risk factor profile and risk for acute myocardial infarction. Journal of acquired immune deficiency syndromes (1999) 2015, 68(2):209.
9. Sico JJ, Chang C-CH, So-Armah K, Justice AC, Hylek E, Skanderson M, McGinnis K, Kuller LH, Kraemer KL, Rimland D. HIV status and the risk of ischemic stroke among men. Neurology. 2015;84(19):1933-40.
10. Chow FC, Regan S, Feske S, Meigs JB, Grinspoon SK, Triant VA. Comparison of ischemic stroke incidence in HIV-infected and non-HIV-infected patients in a US health care system. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2012;60(4):351.
11. Freiberg MS, Chang C-CH, Skanderson M, Patterson OV, DuVall SL, Brandt CA, So-Armah KA, Vasan RS, Oursler KA, Gottdiener J. Association between HIV infection and the risk of heart failure with reduced ejection fraction and preserved ejection fraction in the antiretroviral therapy era: results from the veterans Aging Cohort Study. JAMA Cardiol. 2017;2(5):536-46.
12. Brittain EL, Duncan MS, Chang J, Patterson OV, DuVall SL, Brandt CA, SoArmah KA, Goetz M, Akgun K, Crothers K. Increased echocardiographic pulmonary pressure in HIV-infected and-uninfected individuals in the veterans Aging Cohort Study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2018;197(7):923-32.
13. Shah AS, Stelzle D, Lee KK, Beck EJ, Alam S, Clifford S, Longenecker CT, Strachan F, Bagchi S, Whiteley W. Global burden of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease in people living with HIV: systematic review and meta-analysis. Circulation. 2018;138(11):1100-12.
14. Ataklte F, Erqou S, Kaptoge S, Taye B, Echouffo-Tcheugui JB, Kengne AP. Burden of undiagnosed hypertension in sub-saharan Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Hypertension. 2015;65(2):291-8.
15. Noubiap JJ, Bigna JJ, Nansseu JR, Nyaga UF, Balti EV, Echouffo-Tcheugui JB, Kengne AP. Prevalence of dyslipidaemia among adults in Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis. The Lancet Global Health. 2018;6(9):e998-e1007.
16. Hall V, Thomsen RW, Henriksen O, Lohse N. Diabetes in Sub Saharan Africa 1999-2011: epidemiology and public health implications. A systematic review. BMC Public Health. 2011;11(1):1-12.
17. Kwan GF, Mayosi BM, Mocumbi AO, Miranda JJ, Ezzati M, Jain Y, Robles G, Benjamin EJ, Subramanian S, Bukhman G. Endemic cardiovascular diseases of the poorest billion. Circulation. 2016;133(24):2561-75.
18. Organization WH. Report on the status of major health risk factors for noncommunicable diseases: WHO African Region, 2015. 2016.
19. Hyle EP, Bekker LG, Martey EB, Huang M, Xu A, Parker RA, Walensky RP, Middelkoop K. Cardiovascular risk factors among ART-experienced people with HIV in South Africa. J Int AIDS Soc. 2019;22(4):e25274.
20. Nsagha DS, Assob JCN, Njunda AL, Tanue EA, Kibu OD, Ayima CW, Ngowe MN. Risk factors of cardiovascular diseases in HIV/AIDS patients on HAART. The open AIDS Journal. 2015;9:51.
21. Odunaiya NA, Grimmer K, Louw Q. High prevalence and clustering of modifiable CVD risk factors among rural adolescents in southwest Nigeria: implication for grass root prevention. BMC Public Health. 2015;15(1):1-9.
22. Oluyombo R, Akinwusi P, Olamoyegun M, Ayodele O, Fawale M, Okunola O, Olanrewaju T, Akinsola A. Clustering of cardiovascular risk factors in semi-urban communities in south-western Nigeria. Cardiovasc J Afr. 2016;27(5):322-7.
23. Hong X, Ye Q, He J, Wang Z, Yang H, Qi S, Chen X, Wang C, Zhou H, Li C. Prevalence and clustering of cardiovascular risk factors: a cross-sectional survey among Nanjing adults in China. BMJ open. 2018;8(6):e020530.
24. Khanal MK, Mansur Ahmed M, Moniruzzaman M, Banik PC, Dhungana RR, Bhandari P, Devkota S, Shayami A. Prevalence and clustering of cardiovascular disease risk factors in rural Nepalese population aged 40-80 years. BMC Public Health. 2018;18(1):1-13.
25. Worm SW, Lundgren JD. The metabolic syndrome in HIV. Best Pract Res Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2011;25(3):479-86.
26. Ministry of Health. Botswana STEPS survey report on non-communicable disease risk factors. Geveva, World Health Organisation. In.;; 2015.
27. Arnett DK, Blumenthal RS, Albert MA, Buroker AB, Goldberger ZD, Hahn EJ, Himmelfarb CD, Khera A, Lloyd-Jones D, McEvoy JW. 2019 ACC/AHA guideline on the primary prevention of cardiovascular disease: a report of the American College of Cardiology/American Heart Association Task Force on Clinical Practice guidelines. Circulation. 2019;140(11):e596-e646.
28. Organization WH. Implementation tools: package of essential noncommunicable (PEN) disease interventions for primary health care in low-resource settings. 2013.
29. Organization WH. WHO package of essential noncommunicable (PEN) disease interventions for primary health care. 2020.
30. Ministry of Health.: Botswana Multi-sectoral Strategic Plan for Prevention and Control of NCDs, 2018-2023. In.
31. Ministry of Health.: Botswana Primary Care Guidelines for adults In.; 2017.
32. Botswana Ministry of Health.: Handbook of the Botswana 2016 integrated HIV clinical care guidelines. In.; 2016.
33. Makhema J, Wirth KE, Pretorius Holme M, Gaolathe T, Mmalane M, Kadima E, Chakalisa U, Bennett K, Leidner J, Manyake K. Universal Testing, expanded treatment, and incidence of HIV infection in Botswana. N Engl J Med. 2019;381(3):230-42.
34. Pickering TG, Hall JE, Appel LJ, Falkner BE, Graves JW, Hill MN, Jones DW, Kurtz T, Sheps SG, Roccella EJ. Recommendations for blood pressure measurement in humans: an AHA scientific statement from the Council on High Blood Pressure Research Professional and Public Education Subcommittee. J Clin Hypertens. 2005;7(2):102.
35. Organization WH. Waist circumference and waist-hip ratio: report of a WHO expert consultation, Geneva, 8-11 December 2008. 2011.
36. Gaolathe T, Wirth KE, Holme MP, Makhema J, Moyo S, Chakalisa U, Yankinda EK, Lei Q, Mmalane M, Novitsky V. Botswana's progress toward achieving the 2020 UNAIDS 90-90-90 antiretroviral therapy and virological suppression goals: a population-based survey. The Lancet HIV. 2016;3(5):e221-30.
37. Agency NAC. Botswana AIDS Impact Survey IV, ISBN: 978-99968-472-4-0. In.; 2013.
38. Tripathi A, Liese AD, Winniford MD, Jerrell JM, Albrecht H, Rizvi AA, Zhang J, Duffus WA. Impact of clinical and therapeutic factors on Incident Cardiovascular and cerebrovascular events in a Population-based cohort of HIVInfected and Non-HIV-Infected adults. Clin Cardiol. 2014;37(9):517-22.
39. Dimala CA, Blencowe H, Choukem SP. The association between antiretroviral therapy and selected cardiovascular disease risk factors in sub-saharan Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE. 2018;13(7):e0201404.
40. Haldane V, Legido-Quigley H, Chuah FLH, Sigfrid L, Murphy G, Ong SE, Cervero-Liceras F, Watt N, Balabanova D, Hogarth S. Integrating cardiovascular diseases, hypertension, and diabetes with HIV services: a systematic review. AIDS Care. 2018;30(1):103-15.
41. Rabkin M, Mutiti A, Chung C, Zhang Y, Wei Y, El-Sadr WM. Missed opportunities to address cardiovascular disease risk factors amongst adults attending an urban HIV clinic in South Africa. PLoS ONE. 2015;10(10):e0140298.
42. Peck R, Mghamba J, Vanobberghen F, Kavishe B, Rugarabamu V, Smeeth L, Hayes R, Grosskurth H, Kapiga S. Preparedness of Tanzanian health facilities for outpatient primary care of hypertension and diabetes: a cross-sectional survey. The Lancet Global Health. 2014;2(5):e285-92.
43. Kwarisiima D, Balzer L, Heller D, Kotwani P, Chamie G, Clark T, Ayieko J, Mwangwa F, Jain V, Byonanebye D. Population-based assessment of hypertension epidemiology and risk factors among HIV-positive and general populations in rural Uganda. PLoS ONE. 2016;11(5):e0156309.
44. Hachey D, van Woerden I, Shiluama R, Singu BS. Weight gain in namibians with HIV switching from efavirenz to dolutegravir. Int J STD AIDS. 2023. 09564624231179767.
45. Esber AL, Chang D, Iroezindu M, Bahemana E, Kibuuka H, Owuoth J, Singoei V, Maswai J, Dear NF, Crowell TA. Weight gain during the dolutegravir transition in the African cohort study. J Int AIDS Soc. 2022;25(4):e25899.

## Publisher's Note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.


[^0]:    *Correspondence:
    Onkabetse Julia Molefe-Baikai
    onkabetsebaikai@gmail.com; baikaimo@ub.ac.bw
    Full list of author information is available at the end of the article

